Architectural Characteristics of Urban Dwellings in Kosovo

Verona Ymeri Hoxha

Vienna University of Technology, Vienna - Austria
e1429838@student.tuwien.ac.at

Abstract. This seminar paper is a research on the theoretical framework of architectural history of 18th and 19th century urban dwellings in Kosovo. Special effort is placed on the particular type of urban dwelling in Kosovo known as “banesa qytetare” [urban house] which has been a subject of study for especially Emin Riza and Flamur Doli in between the 1993 and 2013. Commencing with thorough description of “banesa” in terms of architectural characteristics, “banesa-s” typology and chronological derivation of its typology as well as spatial distribution, followed by composition of volumes that correspond to types of “banesa”, and significant features that give naming to the particular type. The material scope will cover “banesa-s” drawings and historic writings, of various researchers. Further analysis will include the ongoing debate on the origin of “banesa” in Kosovo in comparison with similar dwellings on the region with special emphasis on the “Ottoman house” in the Balkans.

Keywords: Banesa in Kosovo from 18th-19th century, architectural composition of banesa, typologies of banesa, banesa with porch [hajat], banesa with gallery [çardak], banesa with side gallery [qoshk], urban kulla.

1. Introduction

Living space has always been a subject of interest for humans as far as history goes; primarily as a necessity, in terms of it being used as a shelter, only to be developed further and become individual's or group of people's expression of creativity and intelligence, especially in functionality of the design. In Kosovo, these designs have reached an outstanding level of development, especially during 18th and 19th century, and even today after being exposed to a countless number of wars and different social systems, they are still being utilized and as such have managed to survive.

This paper identifies the theoretical framework on existing studies and debates on urban dwellings [banesa] in Kosovo during 18th and 19th century.

Architecture of old houses of Kosovo belongs to the architecture that independently prevailed upon profane construction in Balkans. It reaches its most artistic value especially in housing, which, after centuries of development, a complete harmony among function, structure and form is achieved.1

Through this paper special emphasis will be placed on architectural analysis of urban dwellings [banesa-s] in terms of what is their typology, chronological development, their space configuration, what construction materials were used and what indicated their usage and of course by whom were these dwellings built?

This paper is based on a rich literature, covering both theoretical and technical research on traditional architecture in Kosovo in general and urban dwellings [banesa-s] specifically, which emerged mostly after the WWII. This indicates that the awareness of the urban dwellings [banesa] preservation has started very late in the 20th century, and by the time their documentation started, a large number of them were destroyed or went through changes, to accommodate the new way of living, which unfortunately covered/removed their original parts.

Nevertheless, those that have managed to survive were mainly documented by former Yugoslavian architects such as Kojić, Petrović, Lukić, etc., whose work was further developed by two main architects and historians of Albanian and Kosovar traditional architecture: Emin Riza and Flamur Doli.
Riza was the first one to use the term banesa for the traditional dwellings in Kosovo and Albania although it is not yet unified and apart from the ones that cite him, the most common term is urban house, or just house. The term banesa was also adopted for this paper, as it is in author’s opinion the most suitable term, and even today the space of living is known as banesa in Albanian language. Therefore, from now on the urban dwellings in Kosovo will be referred to as banesa.

This paper is a literature based research with a critical review on the existing literature on the urban dwellings in the territory of Kosovo from the 18th and 19th century. Subsequently, the paper will study the urban dwelling examples by taking into account their space configuration, construction materials, analysis of the typologies, chronological development and their regional distribution.

2. Typology, chronology and distribution of banesa in Kosovo

There is no unified terminology that is used to refer to these traditional dwellings; they have had many appellations among which the most suitable one, in author’s opinion, is the one used by Riza according to whom the Kosovar urban house from the 18th and 19th century, is considered the whole scope of constructed urban dwellings, which is regarded as such because the base of the habitat’s economy was craftsmanship and trade, differing from villages, where the main economy was agriculture and farming.

Urban dwelling [banesa] is a traditional dwelling built by craftsmen who gained their knowledge purely based on experience. It has folkloric quality because it was built by uneducated folkloric craftsmen together with orderer’s instructions who were no more than casual citizens with no professional knowledge apart from what their memories could recall.

Banesa in Kosovo is more often than not, treated as part of the larger family; depending on the author’s point of view, it is grouped among either Albanian living territories or Balkan region and sometimes it goes as far as wherever the Ottomans lived. Emin Riza who spent his entire life studying these dwellings, groups banesa into two higher categories, which according to him are specific to only regions mostly inhabited by Albanians. These two main categories are: urban dwellings (banesa qytetare) and rural dwellings (banesa fshatari).

Banesa’s typology proposed and used by Riza, elaborated more by Doli with small changes (more specific to the city of study), are the ones that fully comply with banesa’s characteristics that accentuate their identity therefore uniqueness. According to Riza there are five main types of banesa in Kosovo which are: 1) banesa with porch [hajat]; 2) banesa with gallery [çardak]; 3) banesa with side gallery [qoshk]; 4) urban towers [kullas]; and 5) special cases. These typologies are adopted for this paper with small change where urban tower [kulla] is treated as special case. Although, urban kulla does not represent one of the typical typologies with improvised area distribution, characteristic of the special cases, in terms of it being built in the city when it doesn’t serve its original purpose as a fortification house makes it part of the special cases group.

Urban banesa in Kosovo from the 18th and 19th century are categorized into four main types:

1) Banesa with porch [hajat]
2) Banesa with gallery [çardak];
3) Banesa with side gallery [qoshk]; and
4) Special cases, houses with special distribution of spaces.

Banesa typology simultaneously indicates the chronological order of its construction; as the number of types increases, banesa evolves into more advanced forms. Banesa with porch [hajat] is the most ancient type built early in the 18th century, examples of which were found even in the 17th century, followed by banesa with gallery [çardak] which in terms of the feature giving its name are very similar since both have the porch but the second one was provided with additional feature that of gallery [çardak]. For banesa with gallery [çardak] Doli (1993) gives two sub-types that are also characterized by the timeframe of their construction: banesa with open gallery [çardak] and banesa with closed gallery [çardak]. For both these categorizations he broadens the typology into sub-
sub types. One of the sub-sub types of Doli is actually the third type of Riza’s typology of banesa, banesa with side gallery [qoshk].

Urban kulla is the most recent type of houses built in Kosovo mostly during the second half of the 19th century. Kulla as a living facility, with its high fortifying features, was more disseminated in rural areas where its functionality as such was effectively applied. However, in urban extent it was a very rare module but with high value for increasing the diversity of banesa’s typology.

2.1 Banesa with porch [hajat]

The first type of banesa in Kosovo is banesa with porch [hajat]. This type, being the oldest from other types, dates back from the 18th century and it gets its name from the characteristic feature in its main façade the porch [hajat]. Porch [hajat] is the space, which is opened in the front and randomly on one or two sides. It is covered by the extended roof that is supported by a number of wooden columns on its front. Apart from its’ main function which is to link other spaces in the house, it was also utilized for living, an elevated area usually covered with planks, known as side gallery [qoshk]. Based on the disposition of the porch [hajat] Riza separates this type into three sub-types: banesa with porch [hajat] in the whole front, on the side and in the centre. The first sub-type is very rare, but it is believed that it was built in the early 18th century, while examples of the other two can still be found mainly in the city of Gjakova.

Orderer is someone who has ordered the house to be built by craftsman.

6, 7 RIZA, Emin (2006); PERLA, Fondacioni Kulturor “Saadi Shirazi”, Tiranë, pg. 82-83
6 RIZA, Emin (2013); Arkitektura popullore dhe vleresimi i saj, Tiranë 2013, pg.17

Banesa with porch [hajat] is characterized with large gardens outlined by long walls. Of course this characteristic is only common in situation when the orderer came from the rich background; whereas, small land lots meant smaller house therefore smaller surrounding walls.

This type of banesa is typically composed by two sections, one in the front and one in the back. Section in the back contains the living space where is included the so-called fire space. The frontal part depending on the disposition of porch [hajat] consists of either porch [hajat] as the single feature or it being accompanied by other living spaces. Common utilization of porch [hajat] apart from being a communication unit of the house was also as a working area for preparation of agricultural products, or other house holding activities. As mentioned previously, another common usage of porch [hajat] was for living, mainly during hot seasons. During this period, the whole family moved their activities in this section of the house, which facilitated a vibrant connection with nature. This solution reflects pure intelligence of its makers especially when considering that this section of the house was in general oriented towards South, Southwest or Southeast. Nevertheless, there are cases when they are oriented towards North, when the land was more or less limited.

Below are given typical examples that have managed to survive and have been preserved only by being utilized by their owners.

Figure 1 - House of Tahir Bakalli in the old part of the city of Gjakova
2.2 Banesa with gallery [çardak]

The second type of banesa in Kosovo is banesa with gallery [çardak]. This type of banesa is one of the most widespread types in the cities of Kosovo and it represents a classic example of open space banesa. Preserved examples, date back from the second half of the 18th and the beginning of the 19th century. According to Riza (2009), examples of this type of banesa were found dating back on the 15th century, before the ottoman occupation. However, since there are no evidences, it is hard to give exact definition on its’ chronology.

Banesa with gallery [çardak] is found nearly in all cities of Kosovo, especially in the city of Prizren, Mitrovica, Gjakova, and Prishtina. Its simplicity in design shows the direct relation to its’ predecessor, banesa with porch [hajat]. Similar with banesa with porch [hajat], banesa’s with gallery [çardak] layout is separated into two sections, frontal and section on the back. The difference is that banesa with gallery [çardak] has two storeys, which have a clear functional separation; the ground floor which in most cases is not used for living and the first floor where gallery [çardak] is situated in the frontal part while living area is situated in the back. Gallery [çardak] is a composition volume of banesa, which can be open in side, two or even three sides. It stands on the top of porch [hajat]; . It stands on the top of porch [hajat]; its cover is supported by wooden columns that arise from porch [hajat]. Porch [hajat] is linked to gallery [çardak] through one-way wooden stairs.12

Banesa with gallery [çardak], is oriented in the same direction as banesa with porch [hajat], with its main view directed to the south. Among many functions of gallery [çardak], being used as a working area for preparation of agricultural products, as communication area, it also played a very important role for hot seasons.13 Kosovar families moved their activities in this section of the house, which with its remarkable construction solution made the summer days quite pleasant. As Bozdogan comments on her paper on “Turkish house” where by citing Le Corbusier’s Voyage d’Orient, his impression on “Turkish house” gardens, which in our case have much similarities with banesa-s gardens in Kosovo, she emphasizes the relaxing environment of these courtyards, with their “greenery, sunlight and air (as afforded by trees and gardens) and lightness of structures (timber frame and infill)”.14

It was very common for gallery [çardak] to have many sections with different levels, which also made visible separation of space utilization, for example, the area, that was used for living similar to banesa with porch [hajat], was slightly elevated from the platform used for communication.

Depending on the architectural features of gallery [çardak], Doli gives two sub-types of this banesa, with opened gallery [çardak] and closed gallery [çardak]. This categorization of sub-types occurs in chronological order; their classification appears from the different time of when they were built. Banesa with opened gallery [çardak] is the earliest version of this type of banesa, which according to Doli is a characteristic of the particular social-economic status of the region in general and families in specific.

12 RIZA, Emin (2006); PERLA, Fondacioni Kulturor “Saadi Shirazi”, Tirane, pg. 85
13 RIZA, Emin (2009); Qyteti dhe Banesa Qytetare Shqiptare shek.XV-XIX, Tiranë 2009, pg.208
The sub-type of banesa, with opened gallery [çardak], is characterized with features common for village houses. This occurrence is due to the orderers’ pragmatism, who have recently moved from the rural parts of the country, hence their habits have not yet been adjusted to the urban life. Open gallery [çardak] in this case was the best solution for its users who were still cultivating their lands. However, the derivation of banesa-s typology with closed gallery [çardak], Riza explains slightly different, according to whom another cause of it would be the cold climate especially in highlands.

According to Riza banesa with gallery [çardak] has three sub-types. Depending on the disposition of the gallery [çardak], banesa can be with frontal gallery [çardak] (gallery [çardak] covers the main façade), with gallery [çardak] on one side and with gallery [çardak] on the center.17 However, in Riza’s sub-classification of the sub-types we have the initial sub-types of Doli. Both sub-types, banesa with gallery [çardak] on the side and banesa with gallery [çardak] on the center have two sub-sub types, banesa with opened and closed gallery [çardak] on the center and banesa with opened and closed gallery [çardak] on the side. In both cases, these categorizations of the sub-types given from Doli and Riza, end up with the matching number of sub-types. The difference is that Riza presents a clear classification of the sub-typology while Doli provides us with examples, which indicate the sub-types of banesa.

Figure 2 - Example of Banesa with closed çardak. The House of Musa-etendi Sheherzade is located in the plain area of the city, in the “Old Saray” street, built by the end of the 18th century.

15 DOLI, Flamur (1993); Shkolla Kosovare e Mjeshtit Popullor Shqiptar, Prishtinë 1993, pg.36
16 RIZA, Emin (2013); Arkitektura popullore dhe vleresimi i saj, Tiranë 2013, pg.37

2.3 Banesa with side gallery [qoshk]

The third type of urban banesa is the one named by Riza (2006) as banesa with side gallery [qoshk]. Although the term ‘side gallery’ is adapted by translated publications, in one’s opinion this is not the correct translation considering the architectural characteristics of this feature. The ‘side gallery’ [qoshk] is the space of banesa which extrudes from contour of the frontal facades which is more often than not positioned in the centre not on the side as the translation indicates.

Banesa with side gallery [qoshk] is more or less the sub-type of banesa with open or closed central gallery [çardak] presented by Doli (1993). As a composing element of banesa with side gallery [qoshk] is a preferred area for living. Banesa with side gallery [qoshk], although not as common as other previous types of banesa-s, saves its connection with the outside world through this particular feature, from which it gets its name. Examples of it could be found in most of the cities of Kosovo but the richest and most advanced ones are in Gjakova.18 Banesa with side gallery [qoshk] were built either as a one storey or two storey building. In general its layout remains simple, composed by three main sections, the central part, communication area in which are positioned stairs in cases of two
storey buildings, and two side living blocks. Examples of banesa with side gallery [qoshk] with two storeys are more common. This type of banesa compared to two previous types, makes a clear break from the architectural furniture and ornaments of other functional elements. Its simple façade with closed shelter, large number of windows, always painted, enlivens with this extended volume that emerges in the center of it. This type of banesa has a very rational solution that matched flawlessly to the new economical standards that developed during the time it characterizes, mainly in the second half of the 19th century and the beginning of 20th century.19

Figure 3 - Example of Banesa with open qoshk (ground floor+first floor); House of Emin Gjinolli (Ethnological Museum) located at the core of the old city of Prishtina, built in the beginning of the 19th Century

18 RIZA, Emin (2009); Qyteti dhe Banesa Qytetare Shqiptare shek.XV-XIX, Tiranë 2009, pg.282

Figure 4 - Example of Banesa with closed qoshk (ground floor+first floor); House of Xhafer Deva built in the 19th Century located in the old core of the city of Mitrovica
2.4 Special cases

Typological classification of urban banesas, naturally, cannot cover all the built examples of banesa-s during 18th and 19th century. Always trying to keep the characteristic composition, both the orderer and the craftsmen, with limitations in space, were forced to improvise, and the products are these so-called special cases of banesa. Examples of this type of banesa-s are the ones located in sub-castle neighborhood in the city of Prizren, which having in mind the design scheme of the relevant typology; create different solutions of volume composition attached to the narrow land. This occurrence is very common for the cities of Kosovo, nevertheless they do not influence the fundamental characteristic of the past traditional architecture, quite the reverse, they emphasize it even more. 20

Another type of banesa that is part of the special cases is urban kulla, which is also one the latest versions of banesa built mostly on the late 19th century. Urban kulla represents a rather interesting occurrence as it is quite unique on its design compared to other banesa-s in Balkans. This type of banesa which is very rare for the cities of Kosovo, mostly found in Peja and Gjakova, has a very specific solution of the kulla type in general. Kulla as fortification is very common in villages of Kosovo and north Albania, therefore, in one’s opinion it is considered to be part of the special cases, since it does not represent typical features of rural kulla itself.21

20 RIZA, Emin (2006); PERLA, Fondacioni Kulturor “Saadi Shirazi”, Tirane, pg. 87
21 The reasons behind this remain to be researched further as part of doctoral dissertation.

versions of banesa; It is typically built in three storeys, but there are examples of one and two storey kulla-s.22

According to Drançolli (2001), the biggest utilization of these banesa-s was mainly for security reasons or as guesthouses. They were, more often than not, built as a secondary house, which composed and fortified the garden walls of the rich families in Gjakova and Peja. Typical construction material for kulla is stone for walls and wood for structure and the well known element of kulla, divanhane [characteristic feature of kulla, with similar function to gallery [çardak]. Kulla-s distribution of spaces is done through functional separation of storeys. The ground floor was usually used as barn [ahri] or storage area, upper floors were used for living, finishing with guest room [oda] situated on the highest floor together with divanhane.

![Figure 5 - Example of kulla built in the 19th Century; The kulla of Hysni Koshi is located in the big market complex in the city of Gjakova](image-url)
3. “Turkish house” vs. banesa in Kosovo

There have been a countless number of debate publications concerning the origin of banesa’s architecture in Kosovo and Balkan region in general. For a long time, the Albanian-inhabited territory of Kosovo was, as with much of the Balkans, included within the political frame of great powers such as the Eastern Roman, Byzantine and Ottoman Empires. This long period of co-existence between different cultures, considering the multi ethnical social interactions in the cities during this period, one can confidently presume that each “visiting” empire influenced greatly the traditional architecture of Balkans in general and Kosovo in particular (as a topic of study). Since banesa in Kosovo derives mostly from 18th and 19th century, Ottoman Empire is the subject of interest, considering its crucial role in socio-economic status of Kosovo during 15th-19th century, always keeping an eye on imprints of its predecessors.

The meaning of the term “Ottoman house” and its successor “Turkish house” has been well established by Turkish architects, such as the architect and historian Sedad Hakki Eldem during the beginning of 20th century, whose work has been pivotal on further studies, documentation and categorization of the Turkish house. According to S. Bozdogan, another theoretician and historian of Turkish architecture, “the term “Turkish house” designates a specific house type that spread over the vast territories of the former Ottoman Empire, from the Balkans to the Arabian peninsula”. Moreover, Bozdogan describes the Turkish house as follows: “timber framed with infill construction, with infill material ranging from bricks to wood, plastered over (lesser examples) and finished in wood in the more elaborate ones”. Additionally, Bertram, enthusiastic historian of Turkish architecture, on his Imagining the Turkish House book, gives detailed description of Turkish house architectural characteristics, typology, construction materials, etc. combined information based mostly on the memories of people that used to inhabit. Even in his description, Turkish house is always referred to as timber-framed house found mainly in Istanbul, Anatolia, Greece and the Balkans. Nevertheless, his observance places him parallel to Riza, when they both agree that these houses (banesa) built in Balkans, varied according to local building materials, as well as to the wealth and size of the families they housed. However, Bertram concludes that all of them “shared a basic architectural vocabulary”.

Riza (2010), acknowledges that the social and political elite of the Ottoman administration who were ethnically Turkish, brought with them architectural styles, values and building techniques, which influenced residential buildings. Nonetheless, he limits this influence to mainly spatial composition and decoration. As he argues against the theory of importation, encouraged by both Greeks and Turks, by paraphrasing Gunai, Riza (2010) agrees with him especially since Gunai (1998) emphasizes the importance of unique local influence that have shaped domestic vernaculars, additionally admitting that “Turkish dwellings must be understood as representative of and befitting a resident Turkish population rather than characteristic of the local...
Balkan community under the Ottoman Empire”27. Following this pattern, Riza defines Albanian banesa as “banesa built by Albanians for Albanians”.

24 BOSDOGAN, Sibel (1995); Politics of Vernacular: The ”Turkish House”, National and Postmodernity, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 1995, pg. 171
25 BERTRAM, Carol (2008); Imagining the “Turkish House”, 2008, pg. 20
26 The theory of importation, a recent and very common occurrence, according to which the derivation of houses typologies is purely the result of ethnical intelligence, and not the socio-economic conditions. (Riza, E. 2006)
27 The quote was cited from translation done by CHwB Kosovo Office, Traditional Architecture and Documentation Methodologies; report series no.15/2010, pg. 78
28 The quote was cited from translation done by CHwB Kosovo Office, Traditional Architecture and Documentation Methodologies; report series no.15/2010, pg. 80

Another important debated subject is the authenticity of guest room [oda]. Guest room [oda] as an important architectural characteristic feature of banesa in Kosovo from 18th and 19th century, occurs as such in Turkish house as well. “It has been argued that the origin of the guest room [oda] lies in the Turkish tent, but this has been dismissed as conjecture.”28 According to Riza, by the time the Ottomans arrived in Constantinople in 1453, together with banesa in general, guest room [oda] has been well established. Its ornamentals during 18th and 19th century with obvious oriental features, brought to us by Turks, regardless of the religion cannot be considered Turkish creation. The lack of furniture, and the existence of architectural furniture, apparently derives from Arabs, who are known to favor sitting on improvised planes.29 Moreover, the special effort put in guest room [oda e miqve], especially in decorations and its prominent role in banesa volume composition, Riza relates to Albanian culture of hospitality (as expressed in Article 96/602 in the Code of Lek Dukagjini: “The Albanian house is the house of God and friend”). 30 Albanians are known to pay special attention to guests, therefore, guest room and when possible guesthouse was one of the most important and expensive parts of the house.

Conclusion

Traditional architecture of urban dwellings in Kosovo is ultimately a subject that needs to be studied further and in more detail. This paper has only shown a glimpse of what exists of it, nonetheless, it has defined the typologies of the urban dwellings, the interrelation between typology and chronological development, the derivation of space distribution to typologies and terrain topography, the relation between material usage and construction methods to climate conditions, etc. as well as the close relationship of the orderers and craftsmen who together form the mastermind behind these extraordinary creations. Both Riza and Doli provide us with an immense number of examples of documented dwellings, some of which I have managed to find and visit briefly. Most of the banesas that I have seen, belong to typologies that derive from more recent years since those are mainly the ones that have survived. Such types are the banesa with open galley [çardak], a very good example of which is the Kosovo Institute for Monument Protection located in Pristina, or banesa with closed side galley [qoshk], the house of Shuaip Pasha, located in Prizren, or city towers [kulla] such as Kulla e Haxhë Zekës in the city of Peja, as well as a countless number of special cases located mostly in Prizren. Considering the established arguments set in chapter 2, regardless the countless attempts to politicize the authenticity of banesa, the studies conducted by those who were genuinely seeking the end of ongoing argument on the origin of banesa, one can only continue to agree and disagree with those arguments. Nonetheless, the most persuasive conclusion is that banesa is a composition of Ottoman architecture mixed with the mere professionalism gained through experience of the Kosovar craftsmen combined with the taste of its orderer. Considering its architectural composing features separately and as part of the entire volume of banesa, its spatial vertical and horizontal distribution of spaces within this volume, its particular emphasis on guest room [oda], relates directly to the Albanian way of living, which nevertheless was greatly influenced by the Ottomans. However, banesa in Kosovo is considered to be a great achievement on development and elaboration of the particular architectural style that purely reflects the psychological-ethnological condition of its inhabitants. If analyzed properly, considering the existing rich theoretical framework, one can see the imprints of different factors, regardless of which, the pureness of its creators design prevails upon others.

28 The quote was cited from translation done by CHwB Kosovo Office, Traditional Architecture and Documentation Methodologies; report series no.15/2010, pg. 80
References

2. BERTRAM, Carel (2008); Imagining the “Turkish House”, 2008.
5. CHwB KOSOVO OFFICE (Report no. 15/2010), Traditional Architecture and Documentation Methodologies, Prishtinë 2010.
12. RIZA, Emin, HALITI, Njazi (2006); Banesa Qytetare Kosovare e shek XVIII-XIX, Prishtinë 2006.
14. RIZA, Emin (2010); Banesa Popullore Shqiptare, Tirane 2010.
15. RIZA, Emin (2013); Arkitektura popullore dhe vleresimi i saj, Tirane 2013.
16. KOJIĆ, Branislav (1949); Stara gradska i seoska arhitekture u Srbiji, Beograd, 1949.